CHEMISTRY SMART
ISSN 2830-6198
https://journals.ki-pi.org/index.php/kim-smart/index

ARTICLE

Analysis of Virtual Laboratory Technology and Serious Game Concept in Chemistry Learning: A Pre-development Study

Fadillah Nisa Caniago[a], Rahadian Zainul[b]

[a,b]Department of Chemistry, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Universitas Negeri Padang, Jl. Prof. Dr. Hamka, Air Tawar Barat, Padang Utara, West Sumatera, Indonesia, 25171

*Coresponding email: fadillahnisacaniago@gmail.com

ABSTRACT
This pre-development study evaluates the effectiveness of virtual laboratory technology and serious games in chemistry education, specifically focusing on factors affecting reaction rates. Through a comprehensive literature review, the study explores the benefits of these tools in enhancing student engagement, motivation, and understanding of chemistry concepts. Findings suggest that virtual laboratory simulations coupled with serious game elements offer a promising approach to enriching chemistry learning. However, challenges such as technological accessibility and assessment methods require attention for successful implementation. Overall, these tools hold significant potential in transforming chemistry education and fostering interactive learning environments.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Submission: February 23, 2024

Receveid: February 23. 2024

Accepted: February 24, 2024

Published: February 24, 2024

Citation:
F.N. Caniago and R. Zainul, "Analysis of Virtual Laboratory Technology and Serious Game Concept in Chemistry Learning: A Pre-development Study," *Chemistry SMART*, vol. 3, no. 2, pp. 9–16, 2024

Keywords: Chemistry education, Educational Innovation, Pre-development study, Reaction rates, Technology integration

Corresponding Author :
Fadillah Nisa Caniago
Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Science, Universitas Negeri Padang, Indonesia
Email : fadillahnisacaniago@gmail.com

1. Introduction

In the field of chemistry education, the integration of technology has revolutionized the way students learn and engage with scientific concepts[1], [2], [3], [4]. One such technology that has gained significant attention is the use of virtual laboratory simulations[2], [3], coupled with the serious game concept. This pre-development study aims to analyze the effectiveness and potential impact of virtual laboratory technology and serious games in enhancing chemistry learning, specifically focusing on the topic of factors affecting reaction rates[5], [6], [7].

Chemistry is a complex subject that often requires hands-on experimentation to fully comprehend various concepts, including factors that influence reaction rates[8], [9], [10]. However, the limitations of traditional laboratory setups, such as cost, safety concerns, and time constraints, have prompted educators to explore alternative methods of teaching chemistry[11], [12], [13]. The emergence of virtual laboratory technology and serious games offers a promising solution to these challenges by providing students with a realistic and immersive learning experience[14], [15].

The primary objective of this study is to analyze the use of virtual laboratory technology and the serious game concept in chemistry learning. Specifically, it aims to:

- Investigate the effectiveness of virtual laboratory simulations in teaching the topic of factors affecting reaction rates.
- Examine the impact of the serious game concept on student motivation and engagement.
- Identify the strengths and weaknesses of virtual laboratory technology and serious games in enhancing chemistry learning.
- Provide recommendations for the development and implementation of virtual laboratory simulations and serious games in chemistry education[16], [17].

2. Experimental

To conduct this pre-development study, a comprehensive review of existing literature and research articles related to virtual laboratory technology and serious games in chemistry education was performed[18], [19], [20]. The selected articles were analyzed for their relevance, methodology, findings, and limitations[21]. The information extracted from these articles was then synthesized to gain insights into the effectiveness and potential benefits of using virtual laboratory simulations and serious games in teaching factors affecting reaction rates[22], [23].

The articles included in this analysis were chosen based on the following criteria:

- Relevance: Articles that specifically focused on the use of virtual laboratory technology and serious games in teaching chemistry, particularly the topic of factors affecting reaction rates.
- Methodology: Studies that employed rigorous research methods, including experimental designs, surveys, and qualitative analysis.

- Publication Date: Articles published within the last five years to ensure the inclusion of recent developments and advancements in the field[24], [25], [26].

The selected articles were carefully read and analyzed to extract relevant information. The key aspects considered during the data extraction process were:

- Virtual Laboratory Simulations: The features, functionalities, and design principles of virtual laboratory simulations used in the respective studies.
- Serious Game Concept: The incorporation of serious game elements, such as gamification, interactivity, and feedback mechanisms, in the virtual laboratory simulations.
- Learning Outcomes: The impact of virtual laboratory technology and serious games on student learning outcomes, including knowledge acquisition, understanding of factors affecting reaction rates, and retention of information.
- Student Engagement and Motivation: The effects of virtual laboratory simulations and serious games on student engagement, motivation, and interest in chemistry learning.
- Limitations and Challenges: The identified limitations and challenges associated with the use of virtual laboratory technology and serious games in chemistry education[27].

3. Results and discussion

The analysis of the selected articles revealed that virtual laboratory simulations offer numerous benefits for teaching chemistry, particularly in the context of factors affecting reaction rates[28]. These simulations provide students with a risk-free environment to conduct experiments, explore different variables, and observe the impact on reaction rates[29], [30], [31]. The interactive nature of virtual laboratory simulations allows students to manipulate parameters, visualize molecular interactions, and gain a deeper understanding of how various factors influence reaction rates[6].

Furthermore, virtual laboratory simulations offer the advantage of flexibility, enabling students to repeat experiments, adjust conditions, and observe the outcomes repeatedly. This iterative process promotes experimentation and critical thinking, as students can explore different scenarios and analyze the cause-and-effect relationships between variables[32]. The visual representation of chemical reactions in virtual laboratory simulations enhances students' spatial reasoning skills and helps them develop a more comprehensive understanding of the topic[5].

The integration of the serious game concept into virtual laboratory simulations further enhances student engagement and motivation in chemistry learning. Serious games incorporate elements of competition, rewards, and challenges to create an immersive and enjoyable learning experience. By gamifying the virtual laboratory simulations, students are more likely to actively participate, invest time and effort, and strive to achieve better results[33], [34], [35].

Additionally, serious games provide immediate feedback to students, allowing them to assess their performance, identify areas for improvement, and make necessary adjustments[36], [37]. This feedback mechanism fosters a sense of achievement and progress, motivating students to continue exploring and experimenting with factors affecting reaction rates. The element of competition, either against classmates or through leaderboards, stimulates healthy peer-to-peer interaction and encourages students to excel in their understanding of the topic[38], [39].

The analysis of the literature suggests that virtual laboratory technology, combined with the serious game concept, positively impacts various learning outcomes and enhances student engagement in chemistry education[40], [41]. Students exposed to virtual laboratory simulations demonstrate improved knowledge acquisition, better understanding of factors affecting reaction rates, and increased retention of information compared to traditional instructional methods[21].

Moreover, virtual laboratory simulations and serious games promote active learning, as students take on an active role in the experimentation process[42], [43]. This active engagement leads to higher levels of motivation, curiosity, and interest in chemistry learning[44], [45], [46], [47]. The immersive nature of virtual laboratory simulations and the gamified environment of serious games create a sense of ownership and autonomy among students, fostering a deeper connection with the subject matter[47].

While virtual laboratory technology and serious games show promise in enhancing chemistry learning, there are several limitations and challenges that need to be addressed[48], [49], [50]. One significant limitation is the reliance on technology and access to appropriate hardware and software[51]. Not all educational institutions may have the necessary resources to implement virtual laboratory simulations effectively[52], [53], [54], [55]. Additionally, the learning curve associated with navigating virtual laboratory platforms and understanding game mechanics may pose challenges for some students[56].

Another limitation is the need for proper assessment methods to measure the effectiveness of virtual laboratory simulations and serious games[57], [58], [59]. Traditional assessment methods, such as written exams, may not fully capture the learning outcomes and skills developed through these interactive platforms[60], [61]. Therefore, the development of innovative assessment tools and strategies is crucial to accurately evaluate student performance and progress[51], [62], [63].

4. Conclusion

This pre-development study provides a comprehensive analysis of the use of virtual laboratory technology and the serious game concept in chemistry learning, specifically focusing on factors affecting reaction rates. The findings suggest that virtual laboratory simulations, coupled with the serious game concept, offer a promising approach to enhance student engagement, motivation, and understanding in chemistry education.

Virtual laboratory simulations provide a safe and flexible environment for students to explore and manipulate factors that influence reaction rates. The integration of serious game elements further enhances student motivation and interest in the subject. By gamifying the learning experience, students are actively engaged, receive immediate feedback, and develop a deeper understanding of the topic.

However, it is essential to address the limitations and challenges associated with the implementation of virtual laboratory simulations and serious games. Access to technology, proper assessment methods, and training for educators are crucial factors that need to be considered for successful integration.

Overall, virtual laboratory technology and serious games hold tremendous potential in transforming chemistry education and fostering a more interactive and engaging learning environment. Further research and development are required to optimize the effectiveness and scalability of these approaches, ensuring their widespread adoption and impact on student learning outcomes.

References

[1] T. Afrianti and R. Zainul, "E-Learning Development on Basic Chemical Law Materials in Senior High School (SMA/MA) to Improve High Order Thinking Skill Ability," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, IOP Publishing Ltd, Feb. 2021. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/1783/1/012128.

[2] A. P. Lubis, E. Ellizar, and R. Zainul, "Preliminary Study of Development of Chemical Equilibrium E-Module Integrated Virtual Laboratory for High School Students," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Institute of Physics, 2023. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/2582/1/012063.

[3] M. Ma'Firah, A. P. Lubis, and R. Zainul, "Acid-Base Learning Outcomes to be Improved Through a Guided Discovery-Based Content Learning System," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Institute of Physics, 2023. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/2582/1/012065.

[4] Astuti, S. B. Waluya, and M. Asikin, "Strategi Pembelajaran dalam Menghadapi Tantangan Era Revolusi Industri," in *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pascasarjana UNNES*, 2019, pp. 469–473.

[5] G. R. Gevi and A. Andromeda, "Pengembangan E-Modul Laju Reaksi Berbasis Inkuiri Terbimbing Terintegrasi Virtual Laboratory Untuk SMA/ MA," *Edukimia*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 53–61, Aug. 2019, doi: 10.24036/ekj.v1.i1.a8.

[6] M. Minarni, E. Epinur, Y. Yusnidar, W. Syahri, R. Rusdi, and A. Afrida, "Penggunaan Laboratorium Virtual Materi Laju Reaksi untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa SMAN 3 Muaro Jambi," *DEDIKASI: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat*, vol. 5, no. 1, p. 11, Jun. 2023, doi: 10.32332/d.v5i1.6437.

[7] U. Sudarmo, *KIMIA SMA/MA KELAS XI/KM*. Erlangga, 2023.

[8] D. H. Suci, R. Zainul, J. Kimia, F. Matematika, and I. P. Alam, "Pengembangan Modul Berbasis Think, Pair and Share (TPS) Pada Materi Kimia Hijau (Green Chemistry) dalam Kehidupan Sehari-Hari," *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 14224–14234, 2023.

[9] M. K. Seery, "Establishing the Laboratory as the Place to Learn How to Do Chemistry," *J Chem Educ*, vol. 97, no. 6, pp. 1511–1514, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1021/acs.jchemed.9b00764.

[10] Kemendikbud, *Capaian Pembelajaran Mata Pelajaran Kimia Fase E - F Untuk SMA/MA/Program Paket C*. Badan Standar, Kurikulum, dan Asesmen Pendidikan Kementerian Pendidikan, Kebudayaan, Riset, dan Teknologi Republik Indonesia, 2022.

[11] Y. H. Rayanto and Sugianti, *PENELITIAN PENGEMBANGAN MODEL ADDIE DAN R2D2 : TEORI DAN PRAKTEK*. Lembaga Academic & Research Institute, 2020. [Online]. Available: https://books.google.co.id/books?id=pJHcDwAAQBAJ

[12] A. Rustandi and Rismayanti, "Penerapan Model ADDIE dalam Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran di SMPN 22 Kota Samarinda," *JURNAL FASILKOM*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 57–60, Feb. 2021.

[13] R. A. H. Cahyadi, "Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Berbasis Addie Model," *Halaqa: Islamic Education Journal*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 35–42, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.21070/halaqa.v3i1.2124.

[14] F. Yücel, H. Sultan Ünal, E. Surer, and N. Huvaj, "A Modular Serious Game Development Framework for Virtual Laboratory Courses," *IEEE Transactions on Learning Technologies*, vol. 17, pp. 966–981, 2024, doi: 10.1109/TLT.2024.3349579.

[15] M. Muchson, B. E. Winarni, and D. Agusningtyas, "PENGEMBANGAN VIRTUAL LAB BERBASIS ANDROID PADA MATERI ASAM BASA UNTUK SISWA SMA," *Jurnal Pembelajaran Kimia*, vol. 4, no. 1. pp. 51–64, 2019.

[16] P. Chan, T. Van Gerven, J.-L. Dubois, and K. Bernaerts, "Virtual chemical laboratories: A systematic literature review of research, technologies and instructional design," *Computers and Education Open*, vol. 2, p. 100053, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.caeo.2021.100053.

[17] D. Checa and A. Bustillo, "A review of immersive virtual reality serious games to enhance learning and training," *Multimed Tools Appl*, vol. 79, no. 9–10, pp. 5501–5527, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1007/s11042-019-08348-9.

[18] S. L. Bretz, "Evidence for the Importance of Laboratory Courses," *J Chem Educ*, vol. 96, no. 2, pp. 193–195, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1021/acs.jchemed.8b00874.

[19] C.-H. Chen and C.-C. Tsai, "In-service teachers' conceptions of mobile technology-integrated instruction: Tendency towards student-centered learning," *Comput Educ*, vol. 170, p. 104224, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2021.104224.

[20] V. J. Owan and A. B. Bassey, "Data management practices in educational research," in *In P.N. Ololube & G.U. Nwiyi (Eds), Encyclopedia of institutional leadership, policy and management: A handbook of research in honour of Professor Ozo-Mekuri Ndimele*, Pearl Publishers International Ltd., 2019, pp. 1251–1265. [Online]. Available: https://ssrn.com/abstract=3516191

[21] E. Pacheco-Velazquez, V. Rodes-Paragarino, L. Rabago-Mayer, and A. Bester, "How to Create Serious Games? Proposal for a Participatory Methodology," *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 55–73, Nov. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i4.642.

[22] D. S. Sany and R. A. Arofik, "Gamification Design of Computer Network Virtual Laboratory using SAGD-VL Framework," *JURNAL MULTINETICS* , vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 1–12, Feb. 2023, [Online]. Available: https://jurnal.pnj.ac.id/index.php/multinetics/article/download/5165/2879/15665

[23] A. S. Putra and R. Zainul, "Serious Games in Science Education: A Review of Virtual Laboratory Development for Indicator of Acid-Base Solution Concepts," *Chemistry SMART*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 1–8, 2024, [Online]. Available: https://journals.ki-pi.org/index.php/kim-smart/index

[24] A. M. Almelhi, "Effectiveness of the ADDIE Model within an E-Learning Environment in Developing Creative Writing in EFL Students," *English Language Teaching*, vol. 14, no. 2, p. 20, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.5539/elt.v14n2p20.

[25] C. wen Shen and J. tsung Ho, "Technology-enhanced learning in higher education: A bibliometric analysis with latent semantic approach," *Comput Human Behav*, vol. 104, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.chb.2019.106177.

[26] T. J. Dunn and M. Kennedy, "Technology Enhanced Learning in higher education; motivations, engagement and academic achievement," *Comput Educ*, vol. 137, pp. 104–113, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2019.04.004.

[27] C. Nicolaou, M. Matsiola, and G. Kalliris, "Technology-enhanced learning and teaching methodologies through audiovisual media," *Education Sciences*, vol. 9, no. 3. MDPI AG, Feb. 2019. doi: 10.3390/educsci9030196.

[28] M. A. Hamid, S. A. Rahman, I. A. Darmawan, M. Fatkhurrokhman, and M. Nurtanto, "Performance efficiency of virtual laboratory based on Unity 3D and Blender during the Covid-19 pandemic," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, IOP Publishing Ltd, Feb. 2021. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/2111/1/012054.

[29] C.-T. Chang, J. Hajiyev, and C.-R. Su, "Examining the students' behavioral intention to use e-learning in Azerbaijan? The General Extended Technology Acceptance Model for E-learning approach," *Comput Educ*, vol. 111, pp. 128–143, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2017.04.010.

[30] J. Wakefield, J. K. Frawley, J. Tyler, and L. E. Dyson, "The impact of an iPad-supported annotation and sharing technology on university students' learning," *Comput Educ*, vol. 122, pp. 243–259, Feb. 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2018.03.013.

[31] J. T. Nagy, “Evaluation of Online Video Usage and Learning Satisfaction: An Extension of the Technology Acceptance Model,” *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*, vol. 19, no. 1, Feb. 2018, doi: 10.19173/irrodl.v19i1.2886.
[32] A. Rahayu, “ANALISIS KETERAMPILAN PROSES SAINS MAHASISWA PADA PRAKTIKUM DASAR-DASAR KIMIA ANALITIK,” *Dalton : Jurnal Pendidikan Kimia dan Ilmu Kimia*, vol. 3, no. 1, Jun. 2020, doi: 10.31602/dl.v3i1.3102.
[33] R. Shadiev and M. Yang, “Review of studies on technology-enhanced language learning and teaching,” *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, vol. 12, no. 2. MDPI, Feb. 2020. doi: 10.3390/su12020524.
[34] M. Bower, “Technology-mediated learning theory,” *British Journal of Educational Technology*, vol. 50, no. 3, pp. 1035–1048, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1111/bjet.12771.
[35] M. Kalogiannakis, S. Papadakis, and A. I. Zourmpakis, “Gamification in science education. A systematic review of the literature,” *Educ Sci (Basel)*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 1–36, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.3390/educsci11010022.
[36] A. Katsaounidou, L. Vrysis, R. Kotsakis, C. Dimoulas, and A. Veglis, “MATHE the game: A serious game for education and training in news verification,” *Educ Sci (Basel)*, vol. 9, no. 2, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.3390/educsci9020155.
[37] M. H. Hussein, S. H. Ow, L. S. Cheong, M. K. Thong, and N. A. Ebrahim, “Effects of Digital Game-Based Learning on Elementary Science Learning: A Systematic Review,” *IEEE Access*, vol. 7, pp. 62465–62478, 2019, doi: 10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2916324.
[38] F. Almeida and J. Simoes, “The role of serious games, gamification and industry 4.0 tools in the education 4.0 paradigm,” *Contemp Educ Technol*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 120–136, 2019, doi: 10.30935/cet.554469.
[39] F. Taillandier and C. Adam, “Games Ready to Use: A Serious Game for Teaching Natural Risk Management,” *Simul Gaming*, vol. 49, no. 4, pp. 441–470, Aug. 2018, doi: 10.1177/1046878118770217.
[40] P. Escudeiro, N. Escudeiro, and M. C. Gouveia, “A Chemistry Inclusive and Educational Serious Game,” in *2022 31st Annual Conference of the European Association for Education in Electrical and Information Engineering (EAEEIE)*, IEEE, Jun. 2022, pp. 1–6. doi: 10.1109/EAEEIE54893.2022.9820516.
[41] F. M. H. Siregar, R. Zainul, Andromeda, B. Oktavia, and A. P. Lubis, “Module Development on Basic Laws of Chemistry Based on the 5E Instructional Model to Improve Science Process Skills in Senior High School,” *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan IPA*, vol. 9, no. 7, pp. 5420–5428, Jul. 2023, doi: 10.29303/jppipa.v9i7.4343.
[42] L. Sera and E. Wheeler, “Game on: The gamification of the pharmacy classroom,” *Curr Pharm Teach Learn*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 155–159, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1016/j.cptl.2016.08.046.
[43] A. A. Tori, R. Tori, and F. D. L. D. S. Nunes, “Serious Game Design in Health Education: A Systematic Review,” *IEEE Transactions on Learning Technologies*, vol. 15, no. 6. Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers Inc., pp. 827–846, Feb. 2022. doi: 10.1109/TLT.2022.3200583.
[44] Rakihmawati, S. Ismet, R. Zainul, D. Roza, and A. Mukminin, “The Development of the Educational Game to Improve Logical/ Mathematical Intelligence,” *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, vol. 22, no. 7, Feb. 2022, doi: 10.33423/jhetp.v22i7.5266.
[45] R. Rakimahwati, S. Ismet, R. Zainul, and D. Roza, “The Development of the Educational Game to Improve Logical/ Mathematical Intelligence,” *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, vol. 22, no. 7, pp. 11–19, 2022.
[46] K. Georgiadis, T. Faber, and W. Westera, “Bolstering Stealth Assessment in Serious Games,” 2019, pp. 211–220. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-34350-7_21.
[47] E. Pacheco-Velazquez, M. S. Ramirez Montoya, and D. Salinas-Navarro, “Serious Games and Experiential Learning: Options for Engineering Education,” *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 3–21, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i3.593.
[48] A. Wimmer, Z. Buzady, A. Csesznak, and P. Szentesi, “Intuitive and analytical decision-making skills analysed through a flow developing serious game,” *J Decis Syst*, vol. 31, no. S1, pp. 4–17, 2022, doi: 10.1080/12460125.2022.2073863.
[49] A. Sújar *et al.*, “Developing Serious Video Games to Treat Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder: Tutorial Guide,” *JMIR Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3. JMIR Publications Inc., Feb. 2022. doi: 10.2196/33884.

[50] P. Gestwicki, "Godot engine and checklist-based spesifications: reviving a game programming class for asynchronous online teaching," *Journal of Computing Sciences in Colleges*, vol. 37, no. 4, pp. 30–40, Feb. 2021, [Online]. Available: http://www.ccsc.org/publications/journals/MW2021.pdf#page=30

[51] W. van der Vegt and W. Westera, "Quality of Reusable Game Software: Empowering Developers with Automated Quality Checks," in *2019 IEEE 19th International Conference on Software Quality, Reliability and Security (QRS)*, IEEE, Jul. 2019, pp. 446–452. doi: 10.1109/QRS.2019.00061.

[52] M. M. Hellström, D. Jaccard, and K. E. Bonnier, "systematic review on the use of serious games in project management education," *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 3–24, Jun. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i2.630.

[53] Y. Zhonggen, "A Meta-Analysis of Use of Serious Games in Education over a Decade," *International Journal of Computer Games Technology*, vol. 2019. Hindawi Limited, 2019. doi: 10.1155/2019/4797032.

[54] M. Manca *et al.*, "The impact of serious games with humanoid robots on mild cognitive impairment older adults," *Int J Hum Comput Stud*, vol. 145, p. 102509, Jan. 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.ijhcs.2020.102509.

[55] G. Papanastasiou, A. Drigas, C. Skianis, and M. D. Lytras, "Serious games in K-12 education: Benefits and impacts on students with attention, memory and developmental disabilities," *Program Electronic Library and Information Systems*, vol. 51, no. 4, pp. 424–440, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1108/PROG-02-2016-0020.

[56] A. Dimitriadou, N. Djafarova, O. Turetken, M. Verkuyl, and A. Ferworn, "Challenges in Serious Game Design and Development: Educators' Experiences," *Simul Gaming*, vol. 52, no. 2, pp. 132–152, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.1177/1046878120944197.

[57] B. Say, H. Altunel, M. Kosa, and M. Koca-Atabey, "Evaluation of an industrial case of gamification in software quality improvement," *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 23–42, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i3.594.

[58] M. Riopel *et al.*, "Impact of serious games on science learning achievement compared with more conventional instruction: an overview and a meta-analysis," *Stud Sci Educ*, vol. 55, no. 2, pp. 169–214, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1080/03057267.2019.1722420.

[59] D. John, N. Hussin, M. K. Zaini, D. S. Ametefe, A. A. Aliu, and A. Caliskan, "Gamification Equilibrium: The Fulcrum for Balanced Intrinsic Motivation and Extrinsic Rewards in Learning Systems," *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 83–116, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i3.633.

[60] W. Sanjaya, *Perencanaan dan Desain Sistem Pembelajaran*, 9th ed., vol. 1. Prenada Media, 2022.

[61] E. M. Rahmah, S. A. Dewi, Z. Hafizhah, and S. Mulyanti, "ANALISIS MODEL PEMBELAJARAN TERHADAP PEMAHAMAN DAN HASIL BELAJAR DALAM MATERI ASAM BASA," in *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Orientasi Pendidikan dan Peneliti Sains Indonesia*, Feb. 2023, pp. 20–25. [Online]. Available: http://publishing.oppsi.or.id/index.php/SN/article/view/5

[62] Y. Alaoui, A. Belahbib, L. El Achaak, and M. Bouhorma, "Unified Process to Design and Develop Serious Games for Schoolchildren," in *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series*, Association for Computing Machinery, Feb. 2020. doi: 10.1145/3386723.3387831.

[63] E. Widyastuti and Susiana, "Using the ADDIE model to develop learning material for actuarial mathematics," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Institute of Physics Publishing, Feb. 2019. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/1188/1/012052.