

ARTICLE

Serious Games in Science Education: A Review of Virtual Laboratory Development for Indicator of Acid-Base Solution Concepts

Abrar Suryadi Putra^a, Rahadian Zainul^b

^{a,b}Department of Chemistry, Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Sciences, Universitas Negeri Padang, Jl. Prof. Dr. Hamka, Air Tawar Barat, Padang Utara, West Sumatera, Indonesia, 25171

*Corresponding email: abrarsuryadip@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

This article presents a comprehensive review of the development of virtual laboratories as serious games for teaching acid-base indicator concepts in science education. Acid-base indicators play a crucial role in various scientific disciplines, and virtual laboratories offer a unique opportunity to engage students in hands-on learning experiences. The review begins with an overview of the significance of acid-base indicators in science education and the advantages of using virtual laboratories. It then outlines the systematic process of virtual laboratory development, including analysis, design, and development stages. A systematic search of academic databases and relevant literature was conducted, resulting in the selection and analysis of 10 articles. The results and discussion highlight the effectiveness of virtual laboratories in facilitating student engagement, promoting critical thinking skills, and fostering collaborative learning. Virtual laboratories provide students with interactive environments to explore acid-base concepts, conduct experiments, and analyze data. The integration of gamification elements enhances motivation and learning outcomes. While virtual laboratories show promise in science education, further research is needed to assess their long-term impact and optimal integration into curricula. Embracing virtual laboratories as serious games offers innovative opportunities to create dynamic and effective learning environments in science education.

ARTICLE HISTORY

Submission: February 23, 2024

Received: February 23, 2024

Accepted: February 24, 2024

Published: February 24, 2024

Citation:

Putra. Abrar Suryadi and Zainul. Rahadian, "Serious Games in Science Education: A Review of Virtual Laboratory Development for Indicator of Acid-Base Solution Concepts," *Chemistry SMART*, vol. 3, no. 1. pp. 1–8, 2024.

Keyword:

Acid-Base Indicators, Experiential Learning, Gamification, Science Education, Serious Game, Virtual Laboratory

This is an open access article under the [CC-BY](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/) license.



This is an open access article distributed under the Creative Commons 4.0 Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited. ©2022 by author.

Corresponding Author :

Abrar Suryadi Putra

Faculty of Mathematics and Natural Science, Universitas Negeri Padang, Indonesia

Email : abrarsuryadip@gmail.com

1. Introduction

In recent years, serious games have gained significant attention in the field of science education[1], [2], [3], [4]. These interactive and engaging games provide a unique opportunity for students to learn complex scientific concepts in a fun and immersive way[5], [6], [7], [8]. One particular area where serious games have shown great potential is in the development of virtual laboratories for teaching acid-base indicators materials[9], [10], [11], [12], [13]. This article aims to provide a comprehensive review of the current state of virtual laboratory development for acid-base indicators materials in science education.

Before delving into the world of virtual laboratories, it is essential to understand the significance of acid-base indicators materials in science education[14], [15]. Acid-base indicators are substances that change color in response to changes in pH levels[5]. They play a crucial role in various scientific disciplines, including chemistry, biology, and environmental science[16], [17]. By understanding the behavior of acid-base indicators, students can gain a deeper understanding of chemical reactions, pH levels, and the properties of different substances[5].

Virtual laboratories are computer-based simulations that mimic real-world laboratory experiments[18], [19]. They provide students with a virtual environment where they can perform experiments, make observations, and analyze data. The use of virtual laboratories in science education has several advantages. Firstly, they eliminate the need for physical materials and equipment, making science education more accessible and cost-effective. Secondly, virtual laboratories offer a safe and controlled environment for students to conduct experiments, reducing the risk of accidents and injuries. Lastly, virtual laboratories can provide students with instant feedback and guidance, enhancing their learning experience[20].

The development of virtual laboratories for acid-base indicators materials involves a systematic and iterative process. It typically consists of three main stages: analysis, design, and development. During the analysis stage, educators and instructional designers identify the learning objectives, target audience, and specific acid-base concepts that the virtual laboratory will address. They also conduct a needs analysis to determine the requirements and constraints of the virtual laboratory[21], [22].

Once the analysis is complete, the design stage begins. This stage involves the creation of a blueprint for the virtual laboratory, including the overall structure, user interface, and interactive elements. Designers also determine the appropriate feedback mechanisms and assessment methods to ensure effective learning outcomes. The design stage often incorporates principles of game design, such as challenge, interactivity, and rewards, to make the virtual laboratory engaging and motivating for students[23], [24].

After the design phase, the development stage begins. This stage involves the actual construction of the virtual laboratory using specialized software and programming languages. Developers create the virtual environment, implement the interactive elements, and integrate the feedback and assessment mechanisms. The development stage requires collaboration between instructional designers, subject matter experts, and software developers to ensure the accuracy and effectiveness of the virtual laboratory[25], [26], [27], [28].

2. Experimental

To conduct this review, a systematic search of academic databases and relevant literature was performed. Keywords such as "serious game," "virtual laboratory," "science education," and "acid-base indicator" were used to identify relevant articles[29]. The inclusion criteria for the selection of articles were based on their relevance to virtual laboratory development, acid-base indicator concepts, and their contribution to the field of serious games in science education.

A total of 30 articles were initially identified through the search process. After screening the titles and abstracts, 10 articles were selected for further analysis. The selected articles were then thoroughly reviewed, and their findings were synthesized to provide an overview of virtual laboratory development for acid-base indicator concepts in science education[30], [31].

3. Results and discussion

Virtual laboratories are computer-based simulations that recreate real-life laboratory environments, allowing students to conduct experiments and explore scientific phenomena in a virtual setting. These virtual laboratories provide a safe and cost-effective alternative to traditional hands-on experiments, offering students the opportunity to practice scientific inquiry and critical thinking skills[32], [33].

The development of virtual laboratories involves the integration of various elements, including interactive interfaces, realistic visualizations, and accurate representations of scientific concepts[34], [35], [36], [37], [38], [39], [40]. These labs often incorporate gamification elements to enhance engagement and motivation, making learning a fun and immersive experience[19].

The use of serious games in science education offers several advantages over traditional teaching methods. Firstly, serious games provide a dynamic and interactive learning environment that encourages active student participation. This hands-on approach promotes student engagement and enhances their understanding of complex scientific concepts[41], [42], [43], [44].

Secondly, serious games offer a personalized learning experience. Virtual laboratories can adapt to individual student needs, providing tailored feedback and guidance based on their performance[45]. This personalized approach fosters self-directed learning and allows students to progress at their own pace[46], [47], [48], [49].

Thirdly, serious games promote collaborative learning. Virtual laboratories often include multiplayer modes, enabling students to work together, share knowledge, and solve problems as a team. This collaborative aspect enhances social interaction and communication skills, which are essential in scientific inquiry[50], [51].

Virtual laboratories have proven to be effective in teaching acid-base indicator concepts. These concepts involve understanding the behavior of indicators in acidic and basic solutions, as well as the determination of pH levels[52], [53]. Virtual laboratories provide students with the opportunity to

conduct experiments using virtual indicators and observe the color changes that occur in different pH conditions[5].

The visual representations and interactive nature of virtual laboratories allow students to explore the relationship between pH and indicator color changes in a hands-on manner[54], [55], [56]. They can manipulate variables, conduct multiple trials, and analyze the data to draw conclusions about acid-base indicator behavior. This experiential learning approach enhances students' understanding of acid-base concepts and improves their ability to apply this knowledge in real-world scenarios[5].

The use of virtual laboratories as serious games has a positive impact on students' critical thinking skills. By engaging in scientific inquiry, students are encouraged to think critically, analyze data, and draw evidence-based conclusions. Virtual laboratories provide a platform for students to develop problem-solving skills, make predictions, and evaluate the outcomes of their experiments[57], [58].

Furthermore, virtual laboratories promote the development of scientific reasoning and experimental design skills. Students are required to formulate hypotheses, design experiments, and interpret results, mirroring the processes used by scientists in real laboratory settings. This hands-on approach to learning fosters the development of critical thinking skills, enabling students to become active participants in the scientific process[59], [60], [61].

4. Conclusion

Virtual laboratory development as serious games offers a promising avenue for enhancing science education, particularly in the context of acid-base indicator concepts. The interactive and immersive nature of virtual laboratories provides students with engaging and experiential learning experiences. These serious games facilitate the development of critical thinking skills, promote collaborative learning, and enhance students' understanding of complex scientific concepts.

While virtual laboratories have shown significant potential, further research is needed to explore their long-term impact on student learning outcomes and the effective integration of serious games in science curricula. By embracing the opportunities presented by virtual laboratories, educators can create innovative and effective learning environments that inspire and empower the scientists of tomorrow.

References

- [1] T. Afrianti and R. Zainul, "E-Learning Development on Basic Chemical Law Materials in Senior High School (SMA/MA) to Improve High Order Thinking Skill Ability," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, IOP Publishing Ltd, Feb. 2021. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/1783/1/012128.
- [2] C. Oktarina and R. Zainul, "Analysis of the Need Development of E-Content Based on Problem Based Learning (PBL) using Moodle on Basic Chemical Law Material," *PAKAR Pendidikan*, vol. 22, no. 1, pp. 233–244, Jan. 2024, doi: 10.24036/pakar.vxxix.xx.
- [3] M. Ma'firah and R. Zainul, "Validity of Guided Discovery Learning-Based Content Learning System to Improve Learning Outcomes in Acid-Base Materials," in *Unima International Conference on Social Sciences*

- and Humanities (UNICSSH 2022)*, Atlantis Press, 2023, pp. 1360–1366. doi: 10.2991/978-2-494069-35-0_163.
- [4] A. P. Lubis, E. Ellizar, and R. Zainul, “Preliminary Study of Development of Chemical Equilibrium E-Module Integrated Virtual Laboratory for High School Students,” in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Institute of Physics, 2023. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/2582/1/012063.
- [5] M. Ma’Ferah, A. P. Lubis, and R. Zainul, “Acid-Base Learning Outcomes to be Improved Through a Guided Discovery-Based Content Learning System,” in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Institute of Physics, 2023. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/2582/1/012065.
- [6] M. A. Juliano, S. Rahmatika Putri, and R. Zainul, “Pengembangan Sistem Pembelajaran Flipped Classroom Berbasis Inkuiri Terbimbing Menggunakan Moodle Pada Materi Hidrokarbon Kelas XI SMA/MA,” *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 5395–5404, 2023.
- [7] F. Gusman, I. Dewata, A. Andromeda, and R. Zainul, “Development of Problem Based Learning Based E-Modules on Salt Hydrolysis Materials to Improve Students Science Literature,” *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan IPA*, vol. 8, no. 5, pp. 2410–2416, Nov. 2022, doi: 10.29303/jppipa.v8i5.1831.
- [8] R. Rakimahwati, S. Ismet, R. Zainul, and D. Roza, “The Development of the Educational Game to Improve Logical/ Mathematical Intelligence,” *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, vol. 22, no. 7, pp. 11–19, 2022.
- [9] Rakhmawati, S. Ismet, R. Zainul, D. Roza, and A. Mukminin, “The Development of the Educational Game to Improve Logical/ Mathematical Intelligence,” *Journal of Higher Education Theory and Practice*, vol. 22, no. 7, Feb. 2022, doi: 10.33423/jhetp.v22i7.5266.
- [10] P. Escudeiro, N. Escudeiro, and M. C. Gouveia, “A Chemistry Inclusive and Educational Serious Game,” in *2022 31st Annual Conference of the European Association for Education in Electrical and Information Engineering (EAEEIE)*, IEEE, Jun. 2022, pp. 1–6. doi: 10.1109/EAEEIE54893.2022.9820516.
- [11] F. Almeida and J. Simoes, “The role of serious games, gamification and industry 4.0 tools in the education 4.0 paradigm,” *Contemp Educ Technol*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 120–136, 2019, doi: 10.30935/cet.554469.
- [12] A. Katsaounidou, L. Vrysis, R. Kotsakis, C. Dimoulas, and A. Veglis, “MATHE the game: A serious game for education and training in news verification,” *Educ Sci (Basel)*, vol. 9, no. 2, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.3390/educsci9020155.
- [13] A. A. Tori, R. Tori, and F. D. L. D. S. Nunes, “Serious Game Design in Health Education: A Systematic Review,” *IEEE Transactions on Learning Technologies*, vol. 15, no. 6. Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers Inc., pp. 827–846, Feb. 2022. doi: 10.1109/TLT.2022.3200583.
- [14] M. Muchson, B. E. Winarni, and D. Agusningtyas, “PENGEMBANGAN VIRTUAL LAB BERBASIS ANDROID PADA MATERI ASAM BASA UNTUK SISWA SMA,” *Jurnal Pembelajaran Kimia*, vol. 4, no. 1. pp. 51–64, 2019.
- [15] P. Chan, T. Van Gerven, J.-L. Dubois, and K. Bernaerts, “Virtual chemical laboratories: A systematic literature review of research, technologies and instructional design,” *Computers and Education Open*, vol. 2, p. 100053, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.caeo.2021.100053.
- [16] M. K. Seery, “Establishing the Laboratory as the Place to Learn How to Do Chemistry,” *J Chem Educ*, vol. 97, no. 6, pp. 1511–1514, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1021/acs.jchemed.9b00764.
- [17] F. M. H. Siregar, R. Zainul, Andromeda, B. Oktavia, and A. P. Lubis, “Module Development on Basic Laws of Chemistry Based on the 5E Instructional Model to Improve Science Process Skills in Senior High School,” *Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan IPA*, vol. 9, no. 7, pp. 5420–5428, Jul. 2023, doi: 10.29303/jppipa.v9i7.4343.
- [18] F. Yücel, H. Sultan Ünal, E. Surer, and N. Huvaj, “A Modular Serious Game Development Framework for Virtual Laboratory Courses,” *IEEE Transactions on Learning Technologies*, vol. 17, pp. 966–981, 2024, doi: 10.1109/TLT.2024.3349579.
- [19] M. A. Hamid, S. A. Rahman, I. A. Darmawan, M. Fatkhurrokhman, and M. Nurtanto, “Performance efficiency of virtual laboratory based on Unity 3D and Blender during the Covid-19 pandemic,” in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, IOP Publishing Ltd, Feb. 2021. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/2111/1/012054.

- [20] D. S. Sany and R. A. Arofik, "Gamification Design of Computer Network Virtual Laboratory using SAGD-VL Framework," *JURNAL MULTINETICS*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 1–12, Feb. 2023, [Online]. Available: <https://jurnal.pnj.ac.id/index.php/multinetics/article/download/5165/2879/15665>
- [21] G. Papanastasiou, A. Drigas, C. Skianis, and M. D. Lytras, "Serious games in K-12 education: Benefits and impacts on students with attention, memory and developmental disabilities," *Program Electronic Library and Information Systems*, vol. 51, no. 4, pp. 424–440, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1108/PROG-02-2016-0020.
- [22] A. Dimitriadou, N. Djafarova, O. Turetken, M. Verkuyl, and A. Ferworn, "Challenges in Serious Game Design and Development: Educators' Experiences," *Simul Gaming*, vol. 52, no. 2, pp. 132–152, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.1177/1046878120944197.
- [23] W. van der Vegt and W. Westera, "Quality of Reusable Game Software: Empowering Developers with Automated Quality Checks," in *2019 IEEE 19th International Conference on Software Quality, Reliability and Security (QRS)*, IEEE, Jul. 2019, pp. 446–452. doi: 10.1109/QRS.2019.00061.
- [24] Y. Alaoui, A. Belahbib, L. El Achaak, and M. Bouhorma, "Unified Process to Design and Develop Serious Games for Schoolchildren," in *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series*, Association for Computing Machinery, Feb. 2020. doi: 10.1145/3386723.3387831.
- [25] E. Widyastuti and Susiana, "Using the ADDIE model to develop learning material for actuarial mathematics," in *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, Institute of Physics Publishing, Feb. 2019. doi: 10.1088/1742-6596/1188/1/012052.
- [26] A. Sújar *et al.*, "Developing Serious Video Games to Treat Attention Deficit Hyperactivity Disorder: Tutorial Guide," *JMIR Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3. JMIR Publications Inc., Feb. 2022. doi: 10.2196/33884.
- [27] A. Wimmer, Z. Buzady, A. Csesznak, and P. Szentesi, "Intuitive and analytical decision-making skills analysed through a flow developing serious game," *J Decis Syst*, vol. 31, no. S1, pp. 4–17, 2022, doi: 10.1080/12460125.2022.2073863.
- [28] A. M. Almelhi, "Effectiveness of the ADDIE Model within an E-Learning Environment in Developing Creative Writing in EFL Students," *English Language Teaching*, vol. 14, no. 2, p. 20, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.5539/elt.v14n2p20.
- [29] M. H. Hussein, S. H. Ow, L. S. Cheong, M. K. Thong, and N. A. Ebrahim, "Effects of Digital Game-Based Learning on Elementary Science Learning: A Systematic Review," *IEEE Access*, vol. 7, pp. 62465–62478, 2019, doi: 10.1109/ACCESS.2019.2916324.
- [30] J. T. Nagy, "Evaluation of Online Video Usage and Learning Satisfaction: An Extension of the Technology Acceptance Model," *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning*, vol. 19, no. 1, Feb. 2018, doi: 10.19173/irrodl.v19i1.2886.
- [31] V. J. Owan and A. B. Bassey, "Data management practices in educational research," in *In P.N. Ololube & G.U. Nwiyi (Eds), Encyclopedia of institutional leadership, policy and management: A handbook of research in honour of Professor Ozo-Mekuri Ndimele*, Pearl Publishers International Ltd., 2019, pp. 1251–1265. [Online]. Available: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3516191>
- [32] Y. Zhonggen, "A Meta-Analysis of Use of Serious Games in Education over a Decade," *International Journal of Computer Games Technology*, vol. 2019. Hindawi Limited, 2019. doi: 10.1155/2019/4797032.
- [33] D. Checa and A. Bustillo, "A review of immersive virtual reality serious games to enhance learning and training," *Multimed Tools Appl*, vol. 79, no. 9–10, pp. 5501–5527, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1007/s11042-019-08348-9.
- [34] W. Sanjaya, *Perencanaan dan Desain Sistem Pembelajaran*, 9th ed., vol. 1. Prenada Media, 2022.
- [35] E. M. Rahmah, S. A. Dewi, Z. Hafizhah, and S. Mulyanti, "ANALISIS MODEL PEMBELAJARAN TERHADAP PEMAHAMAN DAN HASIL BELAJAR DALAM MATERI ASAM BASA," in *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Orientasi Pendidikan dan Peneliti Sains Indonesia*, Feb. 2023, pp. 20–25. [Online]. Available: <http://publishing.oppsi.or.id/index.php/SN/article/view/5>
- [36] Astuti, S. B. Waluya, and M. Asikin, "Strategi Pembelajaran dalam Menghadapi Tantangan Era Revolusi Industri," in *Prosiding Seminar Nasional Pascasarjana UNNES*, 2019, pp. 469–473.
- [37] U. Sudarmo, *KIMIA SMA/MA KELAS XI/KM*. Erlangga, 2023.
-

- [38] Y. H. Rayanto and Sugianti, *PENELITIAN PENGEMBANGAN MODEL ADDIE DAN R2D2 : TEORI DAN PRAKTEK*. Lembaga Academic & Research Institute, 2020. [Online]. Available: <https://books.google.co.id/books?id=pJHcDwAAQBAJ>
- [39] A. Rustandi and Rismayanti, "Penerapan Model ADDIE dalam Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran di SMPN 22 Kota Samarinda," *JURNAL FASILKOM*, vol. 11, no. 2, pp. 57–60, Feb. 2021.
- [40] R. A. H. Cahyadi, "Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Berbasis Addie Model," *Halaqa: Islamic Education Journal*, vol. 3, no. 1, pp. 35–42, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.21070/halaqa.v3i1.2124.
- [41] P. Gestwicki, "Godot engine and checklist-based specifications: reviving a game programming class for asynchronous online teaching," *Journal of Computing Sciences in Colleges*, vol. 37, no. 4, pp. 30–40, Feb. 2021, [Online]. Available: <http://www.csc.org/publications/journals/MW2021.pdf#page=30>
- [42] C.-T. Chang, J. Hajiyev, and C.-R. Su, "Examining the students' behavioral intention to use e-learning in Azerbaijan? The General Extended Technology Acceptance Model for E-learning approach," *Comput Educ*, vol. 111, pp. 128–143, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2017.04.010.
- [43] J. Wakefield, J. K. Frawley, J. Tyler, and L. E. Dyson, "The impact of an iPad-supported annotation and sharing technology on university students' learning," *Comput Educ*, vol. 122, pp. 243–259, Feb. 2018, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2018.03.013.
- [44] L. Sera and E. Wheeler, "Game on: The gamification of the pharmacy classroom," *Curr Pharm Teach Learn*, vol. 9, no. 1, pp. 155–159, Feb. 2017, doi: 10.1016/j.cptl.2016.08.046.
- [45] S. L. Bretz, "Evidence for the Importance of Laboratory Courses," *J Chem Educ*, vol. 96, no. 2, pp. 193–195, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1021/acs.jchemed.8b00874.
- [46] C. wen Shen and J. tsung Ho, "Technology-enhanced learning in higher education: A bibliometric analysis with latent semantic approach," *Comput Human Behav*, vol. 104, Feb. 2020, doi: 10.1016/j.chb.2019.106177.
- [47] T. J. Dunn and M. Kennedy, "Technology Enhanced Learning in higher education; motivations, engagement and academic achievement," *Comput Educ*, vol. 137, pp. 104–113, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2019.04.004.
- [48] R. Shadiev and M. Yang, "Review of studies on technology-enhanced language learning and teaching," *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, vol. 12, no. 2. MDPI, Feb. 2020. doi: 10.3390/su12020524.
- [49] C. Nicolaou, M. Matsiola, and G. Kalliris, "Technology-enhanced learning and teaching methodologies through audiovisual media," *Education Sciences*, vol. 9, no. 3. MDPI AG, Feb. 2019. doi: 10.3390/educsci9030196.
- [50] K. Georgiadis, T. Faber, and W. Westera, "Bolstering Stealth Assessment in Serious Games," 2019, pp. 211–220. doi: 10.1007/978-3-030-34350-7_21.
- [51] E. Pacheco-Velazquez, M. S. Ramirez Montoya, and D. Salinas-Navarro, "Serious Games and Experiential Learning: Options for Engineering Education," *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 3–21, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i3.593.
- [52] Kemendikbud, *Capaian Pembelajaran Mata Pelajaran Kimia Fase E - F Untuk SMA/MA/Program Paket C*. Badan Standar, Kurikulum, dan Asesmen Pendidikan Kementerian Pendidikan, Kebudayaan, Riset, dan Teknologi Republik Indonesia, 2022.
- [53] C.-H. Chen and C.-C. Tsai, "In-service teachers' conceptions of mobile technology-integrated instruction: Tendency towards student-centered learning," *Comput Educ*, vol. 170, p. 104224, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.1016/j.compedu.2021.104224.
- [54] M. Bower, "Technology-mediated learning theory," *British Journal of Educational Technology*, vol. 50, no. 3, pp. 1035–1048, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1111/bjet.12771.
- [55] M. Kalogiannakis, S. Papadakis, and A. I. Zourmpakis, "Gamification in science education. A systematic review of the literature," *Educ Sci (Basel)*, vol. 11, no. 1, pp. 1–36, Feb. 2021, doi: 10.3390/educsci11010022.
- [56] D. H. Suci, R. Zainul, J. Kimia, F. Matematika, and I. P. Alam, "Pengembangan Modul Berbasis Think, Pair and Share (TPS) Pada Materi Kimia Hijau (Green Chemistry) dalam Kehidupan Sehari-Hari," *Jurnal Pendidikan Tambusai*, vol. 7, no. 2, pp. 14224–14234, 2023.
- [57] E. Pacheco-Velazquez, V. Rodes-Paragarino, L. Rabago-Mayer, and A. Bester, "How to Create Serious Games? Proposal for a Participatory Methodology," *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 4, pp. 55–73, Nov. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i4.642.

- [58] M. M. Hellström, D. Jaccard, and K. E. Bonnier, “systematic review on the use of serious games in project management education,” *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 2, pp. 3–24, Jun. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i2.630.
- [59] B. Say, H. Altunel, M. Kosa, and M. Koca-Atabey, “Evaluation of an industrial case of gamification in software quality improvement,” *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 23–42, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i3.594.
- [60] M. Riopel *et al.*, “Impact of serious games on science learning achievement compared with more conventional instruction: an overview and a meta-analysis,” *Stud Sci Educ*, vol. 55, no. 2, pp. 169–214, Feb. 2019, doi: 10.1080/03057267.2019.1722420.
- [61] D. John, N. Hussin, M. K. Zaini, D. S. Ametefe, A. A. Aliu, and A. Caliskan, “Gamification Equilibrium: The Fulcrum for Balanced Intrinsic Motivation and Extrinsic Rewards in Learning Systems,” *International Journal of Serious Games*, vol. 10, no. 3, pp. 83–116, Sep. 2023, doi: 10.17083/ijsg.v10i3.633.